




February 3, 2021

Daniel A. Reed
Senior Vice President for Academic Affairs
205 Park Bldg.
Campus

APPROVED:

 **2/4/21**
Daniel A. Reed Date
SVP for Academic Affairs

RE: Graduate Council Review
Department of Marketing

 **2/4/21**
Ruth V. Watkins Date
President

Dear Vice President Reed:

Enclosed is the Graduate Council's review of the Department of Marketing. Included in this review packet are the report prepared by the Graduate Council, the Department Profile, and the Memorandum of Understanding resulting from the review wrap-up meeting.

After your approval, please forward this packet to President Ruth Watkins for her review. It will then be sent to the Academic Senate to be placed on the information calendar for the next Senate meeting.

Sincerely,



David B. Kieda
Dean, The Graduate School

Encl.

XC: Stephen J. Carson, Chair, Department of Marketing
Taylor R. Randall, Dean, David Eccles School of Business
Rachel M. Hayes, Associate Dean for Faculty and Research, David Eccles School of Business

The Graduate School
201 Presidents Circle, Room 302
Salt Lake City, Utah 84112-9016
(801)581-7642
FAX (801)581-6749
<http://www.gradschool.utah.edu>

The Graduate School - The University of Utah

**GRADUATE COUNCIL REPORT TO THE SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT
FOR ACADEMIC AFFAIRS AND THE ACADEMIC SENATE**

October 28, 2019

The Graduate Council has completed its review of the **Department of Marketing**. The External Reviewer was:

Laura Kornish, PhD
Professor of Marketing
Marketing Division Chair
Leeds School of Business
University of Colorado, Boulder

The Internal Reviewer for the University of Utah was:

Lee Ellington, PhD
Associate Professor
College of Nursing

This report of the Graduate Council is based on the self-study submitted by the Department of Marketing, the reports of the external and internal reviewers, and responses to the external and internal reports from the Department Chair and Dean of the David Eccles School of Business.

DEPARTMENT PROFILE

Program Overview

The Department of Marketing (hereafter “the Department”), housed in the David Eccles School of Business (hereafter “Eccles School”), offers programs at the undergraduate, master’s, and doctoral levels. The Department’s mission is to contribute to the development of new knowledge across several domains within marketing and to publish impactful research. In addition, the Department aims to prepare students for professional careers in marketing, sales, and related fields by providing students with the skills necessary to excel in today’s technologically sophisticated marketing environment.

The Department offers both BA and BS degrees in Marketing, an emphasis in professional selling and business development, as well as a minor in professional selling and business development. In response to the last Graduate Council review, the Department has improved its digital marketing offerings and increased its undergraduate course offerings, as well as increasing the number of course sections. In addition, the Department successfully launched an advertising lab, AdThing, which is staffed by students.

The Department continues to offer master’s level classes in the professional, online, and executive MBA programs. Since the last Graduate Council review, the Department has developed a Business Analytics degree in conjunction with the Department of Operations and Information Systems (OIS).

In light of the additional coursework and the new advertising lab, the Department has remained stable while adapting to an evolving environment. The Department faculty remain collegial with highly qualified junior faculty who are dedicated to student achievement at each level of training, and senior faculty who are distinguished researchers and leaders. The career-line faculty are accomplished and devoted to student success. Both tenure- and career-line faculty teach courses designated as Core Courses, Global Perspectives, Marketing Management, Advertising and Promotion, and Professional Sales and Business Development.

Faculty

Tenure-Line Faculty: Marketing is currently comprised of 10 tenure-line faculty: 6 full-professors, 1 associate professor, and 3 assistant professors. According to the external review, faculty “get along very well, emphasizing that the culture within the department is strong, built on mutual respect, and shared research values.” Since the last Graduate Council review one assistant professor left for another position, one passed away, and a full professor retired. There is a strong collegial culture among the tenure-line faculty.

Each research-active faculty member is engaged in at least one of the four types of marketing research: quantitative research (which builds on “economics/statistics/computer science-based training”); behavioral research (which builds on “psychology-based training”); strategy research; and qualitative research. The external reviewer reported that a “strength of the department is the boundary-spanning training and interests of the faculty. For example, the department has a behavioral researcher who teaches computer-science-related analytical techniques in the Master’s of Business Analytics (MSBA) program.”

A concern of tenure-line faculty is the lack of growth in the number of tenure-line faculty. At present, the number of faculty in the Department is similar in size as it was 10 years ago despite a continued increase in the number of students. A particular need in the newly expanding “professional selling” area was discussed. The Dean and Associate Dean of the Eccles School expressed support for regular growth in the Department, with one incremental line every other year. However, there seems to be a slight miscommunication between what the deans have reported and actions that have taken place in hiring additional faculty. A potential obstacle in hiring may be due to the early timing required for recruitment to an academic position in Marketing. Specifically, ads for faculty positions in Marketing are typically placed in late spring and interviews happen in the summer for the next fall. It would be helpful to move the commitment to early spring in order to keep up with this timeline. The Dean’s response letter acknowledged sensitivity to this concern and expressed an intention to accelerate the approval process for hires in the Department.

Tenured faculty prefer to hire and invest in junior faculty (assistant professor level) rather than recruit from the thinner mid-career market. The external reviewer stated that the faculty “are willing to make the investment of time, attention, and resources necessary to give the assistant professors every chance of being successful,” but also suggested clearer communication with junior faculty about the timing of their milestone reviews. The internal reviewer relayed that junior faculty felt somewhat isolated and disconnected from mentorship resources. Assessing and addressing the needs in this area would help in building a stronger culture of success and support for junior faculty.

The gender make-up of tenure-line faculty is as follows: full professors are comprised of 3 females and 3 males, 1 female associate professor, and 3 male assistant professors. The racial composition of tenure-line faculty is as follows: 4 full professors are white, 2 are Asian, 1 associate professor is white, and 3 assistant professors are Asian. Four faculty members are international.

Career-Line Faculty: The Department employs 7 career-line faculty, with varying teaching loads from two to 10 courses a year dependent upon their administrative duties. These faculty have brought new skills that have instilled freshness in the digital marketing curriculum. Several career-line faculty members have major roles in the Department; for example, one is a director in the Business Scholars Program while another runs AdThing. Career-line faculty expressed “appreciation for the Department Chair, who they described as accessible, realistic, flexible and student-centric.” They found the Eccles School and Department collegial, but noted that some career-line faculty feel undervalued and underpaid. All career-line faculty are white and all but one are male.

Adjunct Faculty: The department employs 11 adjunct faculty on a course-by-course basis. These faculty teach one to two sections of a class per year. Each has a master’s degree and significant industry experience. All adjuncts identify as white and all but one are male.

Students

Undergraduate Students: The Eccles School has made a few changes in the undergraduate application process. In the past, undergraduate students began their affiliation with the School in their junior year. Students either applied to the Eccles School from within the university, or completed two years of community college and then transferred. The recently instituted Business Scholars program aims to recruit “high-achieving students” at the beginning of their college careers. The current class of Business Scholars consists of approximately 400 students, with plans to grow to cohorts of 600. This program has the potential to better prepare undergraduate students for post-graduate success. The internal reviewer noted that undergraduate students “expressed

enthusiasm for marketing related clubs (American Marketing Association and DEX/DECA) in creating cohesion, visibility for the major, and preparation for future careers.”

Female students comprise approximately 45% of the undergraduate student body in the Department, which is admirably balanced. As a snapshot, out of a total of 186 undergraduate students in 2017, there were 7 students who identify as Hispanic/Latino, 1 as American Indian, 10 as Asian, and 1 as Pacific Islander. Twenty-one students identify with two or more ethnicities. The Business Scholar program directors continue to put forth efforts to attract more female applicants by marketing the program's benefits.

Graduate Students: The Department admits one to three doctoral students per year. The doctoral cohort is an appropriate size at seven students spread across five years of entry. These students are supported by the Eccles School with a stipend and tuition benefit for five years. Doctoral students typically work as research or teaching assistants. Each doctoral student is required to teach one course after shadowing and serving as a TA. Doctoral students move into candidacy by completing and passing first-year and second-year papers. These students are involved in research and work closely with their advisors from the start of the program. The student retention rate is high in the Department.

Doctoral students expressed a desire for informal presentation opportunities, feeling they would benefit from faculty feedback and mentoring. They see value in having greater opportunities to learn about other faculty members' research, as well as informal research conversations. The Chair's response indicated that the Department has already instituted a biweekly seminar to bring together faculty and students. Students expressed concern about having adequate lab space to conduct research. At times they were denied access to labs due to corporate activities. Students would also like to meet as a cohort in order to bond and feel connected. The external reviewer suggested empowering students to be proactive about creating such opportunities.

Curriculum

The Department offers BA and BS degrees in Marketing. This major can include an emphasis in professional selling and business development. A minor in professional selling and business development is also available for non-Marketing majors and non-Eccles School students. The professional selling program, which meets a growing demand from employers, was launched in 2018 and currently has 10 students enrolled. The Eccles School is making changes to its undergraduate core curriculum that will affect each department, including Marketing. Details of these changes were being addressed at the time of the review. The Department currently offers 14 electives as well as an internship for undergraduates. Students expressed a wish to be exposed to the major earlier in their college experience (prior to junior year). Changes to the curriculum and the growth of the Business Scholars Program are likely to address this concern.

Master's level classes include coursework in the professional, online, and executive MBA programs. The MSBA degree, co-offered in conjunction with the OIS Department and launched in 2016, has 80 students enrolled. The external reviewer stated that there is “a strong job market for graduates who possess these skills.”

Doctoral students are involved in research beginning their first year. They must complete a research paper in both year one and year two with these papers satisfying their qualifying exams. Several of these papers are published in peer-reviewed journals. Seven courses are offered to doctoral students; the external reviewer stated that the doctoral students were being well-trained, with programs of study that include coursework in psychology, economics, and computer science.

Program Effectiveness and Outcomes Assessment

As described in the self-study, the Eccles School conducts outcome assessments centrally for both undergraduate and graduate programs. This includes the MBA and MSBA programs. The Department monitors feedback from this process and adjusts its curriculum accordingly. Previous adjustments have included changes to both the core and required courses as well as adding several new electives. The self-study also states that “all of the Department’s online offerings have been created or updated within the last 2-3 years.”

Facilities and Resources

The Eccles School physical facilities are superb. Classrooms are state of the art and research labs are adequate. Many faculty rely on the behavioral lab and the external reviewer stressed that it is a valuable asset. However, faculty worry that occasional requests to repurpose the space reflect that the research performed in the lab does not have a high enough profile or acknowledgement of its importance to the School. Despite recent expansion with the opening of the Robert H. and Katharine B. Garff Building, space is limited, resulting in at least one career-line faculty member and doctoral student sharing a cubicle. Doctoral students also lament that space is “at a premium” when looking for space to work with subjects.

Assistant professors would like help with data collection opportunities involving local companies. Top journals in marketing value field experiments and deem them the gold standard. With the Eccles School’s ties to the community this seems like a valid request that would be of value to all. Another suggestion from junior faculty was developing a way to ensure higher data quality control in the study subject pools. The “paid pool” is defunct due to lack of subjects, and the “credit pool” has a quality constraint in that students are assigned hour-long subject slots. The external reviewer suggested that with more, shorter slots, each subject’s attention may be more focused and felt that a lab manager might help with this.

COMMENDATIONS

1. The faculty are extremely committed to student achievement and success. This is evidenced by providing doctoral students with protected time, funding, varied research experiences, and support in publishing their own work; master’s students with the newly developed MSBA program; and undergraduate students with the addition of the Sales major and the two new clubs (American Marketing Association and DEX/DECA).
2. The Department is commended for addressing concerns of previous reviews. With the addition of new courses and AdThing, the Department has been flexible in meeting demands of a changing field, while also maintaining stability.
3. Tenure- and career-line faculty are collegial and devoted to the mission of the Department. Faculty are highly valued by their peers, administration and students, and contribute markedly to the success of the Department.

RECOMMENDATIONS

1. The Department leadership should continue to encourage career- and tenure-line faculty to collaborate in ensuring all students receive the best possible combination of education – one based on industry practice and research findings.
2. The Department leadership, faculty, and dean should continue to devote efforts in engaging in open communication in order to assure transparency and action concerning changes to the program, curriculum, and tenure-line faculty hiring.
3. The Department should continue to create opportunities that benefit their intellectual community members. Opportunities should be tailored to support and mentor junior faculty and doctoral students.
4. The Department should continue driving toward gender and racial balance in both the students and faculty.

Submitted by the Ad Hoc Committee of the Graduate Council:

Robert J. Kraemer (Chair)
Associate Professor, Department of Communication Sciences and Disorders

Jeffrey R. Moore
Associate Professor, Department of Geology and Geophysics

College Name
David Eccles School of Business

Department Name
Marketing

Program
All

Faculty Headcount

		2011-2012	2012-2013	2013-2014	2014-2015	2015-2016	2016-2017	2017-2018	2018-2019
With Doctoral Degrees Including MFA and Other Terminal Degrees	Full-Time Tenured Faculty	6	7	7	8	7	6	6	6
	Full-Time Tenure Track	3	2	2	1	1	2	4	4
	Full-Time Career Line/Adjunct Faculty	3	2	2	2	3	1	1	3
	Part-Time Tenure/Tenure Track	0	0	0	0	1	2	1	1
	Part-Time Career Line/Adjunct Faculty	0	0	0	0	0	0	1	0
	Total	12	11	11	11	12	11	13	14
With Masters Degrees	Full-Time Tenured Faculty								
	Full-Time Tenure Track								
	Full-Time Career Line/Adjunct Faculty	1	1	2	2	2	4	3	3
	Part-Time Tenure/Tenure Track								
	Part-Time Career Line/Adjunct Faculty	0	0	0	0	0	0	2	2
	Total	1	1	2	2	2	4	5	5
With Bachelor Degrees	Full-Time Tenured Faculty								
	Full-Time Tenure Track								
	Full-Time Career Line/Adjunct Faculty	0	0	0	0	0	1	1	1
	Part-Time Tenure/Tenure Track								
	Part-Time Career Line/Adjunct Faculty								
	Total	0	0	0	0	0	1	1	1
Total Headcount Faculty	Full-Time Tenured Faculty	6	7	7	8	7	6	6	6
	Full-Time Tenure Track	3	2	2	1	1	2	4	4
	Full-Time Career Line/Adjunct Faculty	4	3	4	4	5	6	5	7
	Part-Time Tenure/Tenure Track	0	0	0	0	1	2	1	1
	Part-Time Career Line/Adjunct Faculty	0	0	0	0	0	0	3	2
	Total	13	12	13	13	14	16	19	20

Cost Study

	2011-2012	2012-2013	2013-2014	2014-2015	2015-2016	2016-2017	2017-2018	2018-2019
Direct Instructional Expenditures	2,184,094	2,326,340	2,786,294	2,927,527	3,139,042	3,510,013	3,749,837	3,694,082
Cost Per Student FTE	6,553	7,507	9,613	10,607	11,011	11,745	12,703	12,098

Student FTE from Cost Study by Instructor's Status with the University

	2011-2012	2012-2013	2013-2014	2014-2015	2015-2016	2016-2017	2017-2018	2018-2019
Full-Time	14	12	13	14	9	8	9	11
Part-Time	1	0	0	0	1	2	2	1
Teaching Assistants	0	1	2	0	0	0	0	0

Funding

	2011-2012	2012-2013	2013-2014	2014-2015	2015-2016	2016-2017	2017-2018	2018-2019
Total Grants								
State Appropriated Funds	1,669,848	1,701,091	1,517,563	1,905,260	668,652	681,854	3,762,369	3,691,156
Teaching Grants								
Special Legislative Appropriation								
Differential Tuition								

Student Credit Hours and FTE

		2011-2012	2012-2013	2013-2014	2014-2015	2015-2016	2016-2017	2017-2018	2018-2019
SCH	Lower Division	1,983	1,635	735	0	0	0	0	0
	Upper Division	5,104	4,776	5,301	5,853	5,805	6,119	5,639	5,783
	Basic Graduate	1.802	1.824	1.658	1.505	1.728	1.777	2.024	2.174

	Advanced Graduate	140	100	115	113	104	121	121	78
FTE	Lower Division	66	55	25	0	0	0	0	0
	Upper Division	170	159	177	195	194	204	188	193
	Basic Graduate	90	91	83	75	86	89	101	109
	Advanced Graduate	7	5	6	6	5	6	6	4
FTE/FTE	LD FTE per Total Faculty FTE	4	5	2	0	0	0	0	0
	UD FTE per Total Faculty FTE	11	13	12	14	19	20	17	16
	BG FTE per Total Faculty FTE	6	8	6	5	9	9	9	9
	AG FTE per Total Faculty FTE	0	0	0	0	1	1	1	0

Enrolled Majors

	2011-2012	2012-2013	2013-2014	2014-2015	2015-2016	2016-2017	2017-2018	2018-2019
Undergraduate Pre-Majors								
Undergraduate Majors	95	77	133	111	138	157	152	166
Enrolled in Masters Program								
Enrolled in Doctoral Program								
Enrolled in First-Professional Program								

Degrees Awarded

	2011-2012	2012-2013	2013-2014	2014-2015	2015-2016	2016-2017	2017-2018	2018-2019
Undergraduate Certificate								
Graduate Certificate								
Bachelors	75	65	97	86	84	109	110	120
Masters								
Doctorate								
First-Professional								



Memorandum of Understanding Department of Marketing Graduate Council Review 2018-19

This memorandum of understanding is a summary of decisions reached at a wrap-up meeting on October 8, 2020, and concludes the Graduate Council Review of the Department of Marketing. Daniel A. Reed, Senior Vice President for Academic Affairs; Taylor R. Randall, Dean of the David Eccles School of Business; Rachel M. Hayes, Associate Dean for Faculty & Research of the David Eccles School of Business; Stephen J. Carson, Chair of the Department of Marketing; David B. Kieda, Dean of the Graduate School; and Katharine S. Ullman, Associate Dean of the Graduate School, were present.

The discussion centered on but was not limited to the recommendations contained in the review summary report presented to the Graduate Council on October 28, 2019. The working group agreed to endorse the following actions:

Recommendation 1: The Department leadership should continue to encourage career- and tenure-line faculty to collaborate in ensuring all students receive the best possible combination of education – one based on industry practice and research findings.

The Chair has an annual meeting with the career-line faculty as a group (beyond meeting individually) and has found that one benefit is the interactions this facilitates among members of this group. He agreed that meeting with tenure-line and career-line faculty together, for the purpose of teaching and program-focused issues, would be beneficial and has plans to do so. Chair Carson emphasized the high-level teaching expertise of his career-line faculty, many of whom also have industry experience, and cited specific examples of collaboration with tenure-line faculty. We discussed the possibility that career-line faculty could help onboard adjunct faculty. Although the use of adjunct faculty may have decreased since the time of the self-study, any person coming to teach without much context would benefit from thorough advice on what the teaching expectations are, coordination of topics between courses in a program, and how to standardize processes such as grading. Chair Carson also stressed that Marketing has a much stronger undergraduate program now than seven years ago, with revised curriculum and the opportunity for more electives. The Department also responded to industry needs in a commendable way by creating the MS in Business Analytics and a graduate certificate in Business Analytics with the Operations and Information Systems Department. Dean Kieda inquired if there was room for increasing certificate programs, and Chair Carson thought there were potential opportunities for this in the Sales area. Of note, adding a tenure-line faculty member in this area was discussed during the site visit and might help drive curricular and program development.

Recommendation 2: The Department leadership, faculty, and dean should continue to devote efforts in engaging in open communication in order to assure transparency and action concerning changes to the program, curriculum, and tenure-line faculty hiring.

Chair Carson felt that communication was open and is committed to ensuring this is optimal. From his perspective the Dean's office has treated the Department well, but there have been a lot of changes and Chair Carson is concerned about any negative perception. Recent initiatives may have a positive effect: hiring lines for tenure-line faculty will be managed on a regular schedule and this will accommodate the early recruiting timetable in Marketing, which has been a source of frustration in the past. In addition, Associate Dean Hayes mentioned that a committee is looking at the governance structure in the Eccles School to find ways that will improve coordination between departments and bolster faculty input. The Graduate School will be interested to learn of new practices the Eccles School implements in future updates. The meetings among career-line and with both career-line and tenure-line faculty mentioned in the first recommendation may also help address communication issues.

Recommendation 3: The Department should continue to create opportunities that benefit their intellectual community members. Opportunities should be tailored to support and mentor junior faculty and doctoral students.

The Department ensures that junior faculty have many supportive benefits, from research funds to reduced teaching. They have bolstered the subject pool, an important research infrastructure, and regularly assess whether it is meeting research needs. Reviewers mentioned hiring a lab manager to optimize use of lab resources; however, since the site visit, faculty member Elena Asparouhova, Assistant Dean for Research and External Funding in the Eccles School, has improved oversight in a manner that the Chair felt addressed concerns. The Department also fosters community by hosting seminar speakers, including any suggested by junior faculty. With several junior faculty members now part of the Department, intentional mentorship will also be key. These efforts should be directed at the academic pathway, not research itself (at least, that is a separate matter). Knowing that more senior faculty are busy, the Department should make sure that their junior faculty take advantage of university- and college-level resources. The Chair could also encourage formation of a peer mentoring group, that he and other senior faculty advise collectively, where appropriate.

Turning to doctoral students, the Chair was enthusiastic about the processes in place to support their research and enhance their productivity. The required first- and second-year papers, in particular, while requiring significant faculty effort, serve to effectively launch students, often resulting in journal articles. The seminar series mentioned above will help to engage students in the intellectual community as well. Quite a bit would also be gained from following the external reviewer's advice to empower students to develop their own activities, organizing forums for feedback and coaching and, along the way, creating a more robust cohort experience. Dean Kieda emphasized that there are also central mechanisms of support for graduate

Memorandum of Understanding
Department of Marketing
Graduate Council Review 2018-19
Page 3

student presentations at external—or now virtual—conferences, which Chair Carson said were well utilized. The Chair's concerns with regard to doctoral students were the need to increase both the quality and numbers of students. Depending on recruitment mechanisms, current and past students are often the best "recruiters" – thus the efforts to enhance the current doctoral student experience will support these longer-term goals as well. A pre-PhD course, mentioned below, might also be a key recruiting tool.

Recommendation 4: The Department should continue driving toward gender and racial balance in both the students and faculty.

Although the Department's tenure-line faculty do not include underrepresented racial/ethnic populations, they are multicultural and very open to increasing diversity. Historically, the tenure-line faculty have been gender balanced. Yet, despite much effort in the recent hiring cycle, diversity and gender balance were not improved. Dean Kieda suggested thinking of strategies that go beyond the job search, proactively seeking to build relationships with people and places in ways that expose the Department and University to diverse academic audiences. SVP Reed added that, beyond bringing visitors here, one can also encourage faculty members to meet with students when they visit other institutions, again building connections that may yield interest later. He also recommended that faculty get involved in national efforts in the discipline to broaden participation, both to make substantive contributions and to raise the visibility of the University of Utah, and the Marketing Department, as a community that values diversity. Chair Carson is considering whether offering pre-PhD coursework would be a way the Department could help develop a more diverse pipeline in their discipline. Career-line and adjunct faculty are not diverse and are mostly male. A female career-line faculty member was recently hired and an "executive in residence" is female. It is hoped that their visibility and activity with undergraduates will attract more female students to the major, but ongoing self-evaluation and the development and implementation of a diversity plan linked to the Department's strategic plan will be required of the Department to address this recommendation.

Dean Randall expressed great appreciation for Chair Carson's contributions as a long-time chair who has done a commendable job of building faculty and tackling new initiatives (such as the MSBA) in creative and collaborative ways.

This memorandum of understanding is to be followed by regular letters of progress, upon request of the Graduate School, from the Chair of the Department of Marketing. Letters will be submitted until all of the actions described in the preceding paragraphs have been completed. In addition, a three-year follow-up meeting may be scheduled during AY 2022-23 to discuss progress made in addressing the review recommendations.

Daniel A. Reed
Taylor R. Randall
Rachel M. Hayes
Stephen J. Carson
David B. Kieda
Katharine S. Ullman



David B. Kieda
Dean, The Graduate School
February 3, 2021